

PHI 516/GER 566/REL 516

Special Topics in History of Phil: Knowledge & Belief in Kant, Fichte, Hegel

Instructor: Andrew Chignell (chignell@princeton.edu)

Spring 2020, Marx 201, Th 1:30-4:20

Office: 232 1879 Hall; Office Hours: Tues 4-5:30 and by appt

A seminar on Kantian epistemology and pistology (the theory of faith or acceptance). Topics include: the nature and ethics of assent (holding-for-true); the nature of knowledge; fallibilism and infallibilism about epistemic justification; cognition and spontaneity; noumenal ignorance; opinion and common sense; epistemic autonomy; and the structure of practical arguments, both pragmatic and moral.

In the final weeks of the seminar we will consider how some of these themes are treated by two of Kant's most influential successors – J.G. Fichte and G.W.F. Hegel. Along the way, we will look at some broadly Kantian efforts in contemporary epistemology by authors like Mark Schroeder and Kurt Sylvan.

Assignments:

1. *Short reflections*: Everyone taking the course for credit is asked to submit **five 1-2 page reflections**. Often these will simply elaborate a question about the reading, but they can also involve criticism or constructive work. These are due on Wednesday night before class at 11.59pm, and should focus on the readings for the following day's class. Graded on a satisfactory/unsatisfactory basis, they are worth (combined) **30% of the grade**. As long as you're doing the required reading, it shouldn't be hard to achieve full credit for this.
2. *Presentation*: Ph.D. students have the opportunity (but not the obligation) to give a short presentation to the seminar. The presentation should include a handout or other aide, and last for around 30 minutes, followed by 30 minutes of discussion. Presenters should plan to meet with me to talk over the presentation at least a couple of days before it occurs.
3. *First paper*: Those who don't give a presentation and are taking this for a grade should plan to submit a 10 double-spaced page paper (which can be a development of a short reflection) by **May 5**. This paper (or the presentation) is worth **20% of the grade**. I will return these papers very quickly so that you can use the feedback as you write the final paper.
4. A *final paper* (of around 20 double-spaced pages) is **due on May 18**. People who write the first paper are strongly encouraged to make this a revised version of the same. For those taking the course for a grade, this is worth **50%**.

Books:

These books are not on order at Labyrinth, because I assumed many people already have them. But you can order them from Labyrinth for a quick delivery, or from Biblio.com or some other online bookseller. All other items on the reading list (including those from the *Phenomenology and Logic*) will be posted on Blackboard.

Primary:

Kant, *Critique of Pure Reason* ed. Guyer/Wood (Cambridge)

Fichte, *Introductions to the Wissenschaftslehre and other Writings*, ed. Breazeale (Hackett)

Hegel, *Faith and Knowledge*, ed. Harris and Cerf (SUNY)

Recommended:

Kant, *Practical Philosophy*, ed. Gregor (Cambridge)

Kant, *Religion and Rational Theology*, ed. Wood/di Giovanni (Cambridge)

Hegel, *Phenomenology of Spirit*, ed. Pinkard (Cambridge)

Hegel, *The Science of Logic*, ed. di Giovanni (Cambridge)

Useful background:

Frederick Beiser, *The Fate of Reason: German Philosophy from Kant to Fichte* (Harvard, 1993)

Eckhart Förster, *The Twenty-Five Years of Philosophy* (Harvard, 2012)

Michelle Kosch, *Fichte's Ethics* (Oxford 2018)

Terry Pinkard, *German Philosophy 1760-1860: The Legacy of Idealism* (Cambridge, 2002)

Kenneth Westphal, *Hegel's Epistemology* (Hackett 2003)

Schedule and Tentative Reading List:**2/6: Course Introduction, Kant on Justification and Knowledge**

- Kant, *Critique of Pure Reason*, Canon of Pure Reason (A795/B823-A831/B859)

Optional background:

- Andrew Chignell, "Assent and Its Epistemic Justification"

2/13: Bolinger on Belief, Acceptance, and Moral Encroachment¹

- Renée Jorgensen Bolinger, "Varieties of Moral Encroachment" (manuscript)
- Renée Jorgensen Bolinger, "The Rational Impermissibility of (some) Racial Generalizations." *Synthese* (2018)

***visiting speaker: Renée Jorgensen Bolinger (Princeton)**

Optional background:

- Rima Basu, "Radical moral encroachment: The moral stakes of racist beliefs," *Philosophical Issues* (2019)
- Georgi Gardiner, "Evidentialism and Moral Encroachment," in *Believing in Accordance with the Evidence: New Essays on Evidentialism* ed. K. McCain (2018)

¹ Due to an unavoidable scheduling conflict, Sarah McGrath's "Moral Encroachment" seminar will be encroaching on our meeting time and place (albeit quite morally), and so I propose to have an extra meeting of our seminar during reading week on May 7. The Feb 13 session is optional, but since the topic of McGrath's seminar is related to ours, I would encourage you to come. Guest speaker is UCHV/Politics professor Renée J. Bolinger.

2/20: Kant on Belief, Acceptance, and Moral Encroachment

- Kant, "What does it Mean to Orient Oneself in Thinking?" (1786)
- Kant, *Critique of Judgment*, 5:461-474
- Andrew Chignell, "Belief in Kant" *Philosophical Review* (2007)
- Guy Longworth, "Faith in Kant" in *Philosophy of Trust*, ed. Simpson and Faulkner (2017)

Optional background:

- Leslie Stevenson, "Opinion, Belief or Faith, and Knowledge" *Kantian Review* (2003)

2/27: Cognition, Spontaneity, and Comprehension

- Kant, *Critique of Pure Reason*, selections
- Kant, *Real Progress* (1790), selections
- Kant, selections from various logic lectures
- Eric Watkins and Marcus Willaschek, "Kant's Account of Cognition" *Journal of the History of Philosophy* (2017)
- Stefanie Grüne, "Kant on the Spontaneity of Understanding" in *Self, World, and Art: Metaphysical Topics in Kant and Hegel*, ed Emundts (2013)
- Karl Schafer, "Reason: The Capacity for Comprehension" (draft)

Optional background:

- Andrew Chignell, "Knowledge and Cognition, Theoretical and Practical" (draft)
- Andrea Kern, *Sources of Knowledge* (ch. 6-7) (2017)
- Houston Smit, "Kant on Marks and the Immediacy of Intuition," *Phil Review* (2000)
- Clinton Tolley, "Kant on the Place of Cognition in the Progression of Representations," *Synthese* (2017)

3/5: Certainty, Testimony, and the Fallibilism Controversy

- Kant, *Lectures on Logic*, selections
- Eric Watkins and Marcus Willaschek, "Kant on Knowledge and Cognition" *Synthese* (2018)
- Mark Schroeder, "Knowledge is Belief for Sufficient (Objective and Subjective) Reason," *Oxford Studies in Epistemology* (2015)"
- Andrew Chignell, "Certainty, Fallibility, and a Backup Plan"

Optional Background:

- Daniel Whiting, "Knowledge is not Belief for Sufficient (Objective and subjective) Reason," *Logos & Episteme* (2015)
- Mark Schroeder, "In Defense of the Kantian Account of Knowledge: Reply to Whiting" *Logos & Episteme* (2017)
- Joe Schieber, "Between Autonomy and Authority: Kant on the Epistemic Status of Testimony," *Philosophy and Phenomenological Research* (2010)

- Axel Gelfert, “Kant on Testimony” *British Journal for the History of Philosophy* (2006)
- Karl Ameriks, “A Commonsense Kant?” *Proceedings of the APA* (2006)
- Lawrence Pasternack, “Kant on Opinion, Hypothesis, and the Norms of General Applied Logic,” *Kant-Studien* (2014)

3/12: Objects of Moral Belief: The Arc of History, Global Justice, and the Highest Good

- Kant, *Idea for a Universal History* (1784), selections
 - Rachel Zuckert, “Loneliness and Ambiguity in Kant’s Philosophy of History,” in *Kant and the Possibility of Progress*, ed. Wilford and Stoner (forthcoming)
 - J. Colin Bradley, “Kant on the Necessity of Global Justice” (draft)
- *visiting speaker: Colin Bradley (Princeton)**

Optional Background:

- Andrew Chignell, “Three Kinds of Moral Belief in Kant” (draft)

3/19: Spring Break

3/26: Sources of Epistemic Normativity

- Reza Hadisi, “Title tbd” (draft)
 - Kurt Sylvan, “Epistemic Kantianism,” *Philosophical Review* (forthcoming)
 - Alix Cohen, “Kant and the Ethics of Belief” (2014)
- *visiting speaker: Reza Hadisi (Princeton/Arizona)**

Optional background:

- Andrew Chignell, “Kant on the Value of Truth” (draft)
- Sasha Mudd, “The Demand for Systematicity and the Authority of Theoretical Reason,” *Kantian Review* (2017)

4/2: Practical Cognition, Aesthetic Cognition, and Symbols of the Supersensible

- Kant, *Critique of Practical Reason*, selections
- Kant, *Critique of the Power of Judgment*, selections
- Karl Schafer, “Practical Cognition and our Knowledge of Things-in-Themselves”
- Andrew Chignell, “Reason’s Needs, Symbols, and Hopes” (draft)
- Béatrice Longuenesse, “Kant and Hegel on the Moral Self,” in *Kant and the Early Moderns*, eds. Garber and Longuenesse (2008)

Optional background:

- Alejandro Naranjo Sandoval, “Noumenal Ignorance: Why, For Kant, Can’t We Know Things-in-Themselves?” in *Palgrave Kant Handbook*, ed. Altman (2017), selections.
- Patrick Kain, “Practical Cognition, Intuition, and the Fact of Reason” in *Kant’s Moral Metaphysics* ed. Lipscomb and Krueger (2009)

4/9: Transition to German Idealism: Intellectual Intuition

- Kant, *Critique of Pure Reason*, selections
 - Kant, *Critique of Judgment*, sections 76-77
 - Kimberly Brewer, "Necessitarianism in §76 of the Third *Critique*"
- *visiting speaker: Kimberly Brewer (Indiana University)**

Optional background:

- Reed Winegar, "Kant on God's Intuitive Understanding: Interpreting CJ section 76's Modal Claims"

4/16: Fichte

- Fichte, "On the Ground of our Belief in a Divine Governance of the World-Order" (1798)
- Fichte, "Appeal to the Public" (1799)
- Fichte, "From a Private Letter" (1800)
- Benjamin Crowe, "Fichte's Transcendental Theology" *Archiv f. Geschichte d. Philosophie* (2010)

Optional background:

- Luc Langlois, "The Meaning of Life According to Fichte" *Fichte-Studien* (2017)

4/23: Fichte

- Fichte, "On the Vocation of Man" (1800) Part III ("Faith")
 - Rory Phillips, "Title tbd" (draft)
- *visiting speaker: Rory Phillips (UC-London)**

4/30: Early Hegel

- Hegel, "Relationship of Skepticism to Philosophy" (1802), selections
- Hegel, *Belief and Knowledge* (1802), section I (Kantian Philosophy) and III (Fichtean Philosophy), but skim section II (Jacobian Philosophy)

Optional background:

- Andrew Chignell, "Real Repugnance and Belief about Things-in-Themselves: A Lockean Problem in Kant and Hegel" *German Idealism Yearbook* (2009)

5/7: Hegel

- Hegel, *Phenomenology of Spirit* (1807), selections
 - Hegel, *Logic* (selections)
 - Jake McNulty, "Title tbd"
- *visiting speaker: Jake McNulty (NYU)**

May 13-14: Mini-workshop on Kant and the Ethics of Belief

Participants:

Yoon Choi (Marquette)
Alix Cohen (Edinburgh)
Reza Hadisi (Princeton/Arizona)
Markus Kohl (UNC-Chapel Hill)
Colin McLear (Nebraska)
Lawrence Pasternack (Oklahoma State)
Melissa Zinkin (Binghamton)

May 15-16: Princeton Kant Conference: The Self